

1 JOHN K. FLOCK ESQ. (SBN 200183)
2 THARPE & HOWELL, LLP
3 15250 Ventura Blvd., Ninth Floor
4 Sherman Oaks, California 91403
(818) 205-9955; (818) 205-9944 fax
Email: jflock@tharpe-howell.com

5 Attorneys for Defendant,
6 COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION

7
8 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
9 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

10
11 KYUNG HEE HUR, an individual,
12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 COSTCO WHOLESALE
15 CORPORATION, and DOES 1 to 50,
Inclusive,
16 Defendants.

Case No.

**NOTICE OF REMOVAL OF
ACTION UNDER 28 U.S.C. § 1441(b)
(DIVERSITY)**

17
18 TO THE CLERK OF THE ABOVE-ENTITLED COURT:

19 PLEASE TAKE NOTICE THAT Defendant, Costco Wholesale Corporation
20 (“Defendant”) hereby removes this action from the Superior Court of the State of
21 California, County of Los Angeles to the United States District Court for the
22 Central District of California pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1332, 1441 and 1446 and sets
23 forth in support of its Notice of Removal of Action the following:

24 **Complete Diversity Exists**

25 1. This Notice of Removal is based in part, upon 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a) that
26 states: “any civil action brought in a State court of which the district courts of the
27 United States have original jurisdiction, may be removed by the defendant or the
28

1 defendants, to the district court of the United States for the district and division
2 embracing the place where such action is pending.”

3 2. District courts have original have original jurisdiction of all civil actions
4 where the matter in controversy exceeds the sum or value of \$75,000.00, exclusive of
5 interest and costs, and is between citizens of different States. 28 U.S.C. § 1332(a)(1).

6 3. Plaintiff, Kyung Hee Hur is a citizen of the state of California.

7 4. Defendant, Costco Wholesale Corporation was, at the time of the filing
8 of this action, and still is, a citizen of the state of Washington. Defendant is a
9 Washington corporation with its headquarters and principal place of business in
10 Washington.

11 5. Therefore, diversity of citizenship exists for purposes of removal of the
12 state court action to this district court.

13 **Amount in Controversy Exceeds \$75,000**

14 6. Plaintiff’s Complaint alleges two causes of action for premises liability
15 and negligence against Defendant. (See Plaintiff’s Complaint, Case No.
16 22STCV32886, Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles, page 1, attached
17 as Exhibit A.)

18 12. On November 1, 2020, Plaintiff, Kyung Hee Hur alleges she was
19 shopping at defendant’s Warehouse located at 13463 Washington Boulevard, Marina
20 Del Rey, California. She contends she slipped and fell on avocado oil. (See Plaintiff’s
21 Complaint, Case No. 22STCV32886, Superior Court of California, County of Los
22 Angeles, page 5, attached as Exhibit A.)

23 13. Plaintiffs alleges that she sustained serious bodily injuries and physical
24 pain and suffering. She further alleges that she sustained general damages, special
25 damages, and personal property damages. (See Plaintiff’s Complaint, Case No.
26 22STCV32886Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles, page 3, attached
27 as Exhibit A.)
28

14. On October 11, 2022, plaintiff, Kyung Hee Hur served a Statement of Damages setting forth the following damages:

Pain, suffering, inconvenience \$100,000.00

Medical expenses \$17,861.00

(See Statement of Damages, attached as Exhibit B.)

15. Plaintiff's Responses to written discovery put Defendant on notice that the amount in controversy exceeds \$75,000.00.

16. Therefore, Plaintiff alleges damages that exceed the minimum amount in controversy requirements for purposes of removal of the state court action to this district court.

Notice of Removal Is Timely

17. On October 11, 2022, plaintiff, Kyung Hee Hur served a Statement of Damages setting forth her alleged damages. (Exhibit B.)

18. The 30-day removal period starts to run only upon defendant's receipt of an "amended pleading, motion, order or other paper from which it may first be ascertained that the case is ... removable." 28 USC § 1446(b)(3). The removal period commences only when defendant is able "to intelligently ascertain" that plaintiff's claim exceeds \$75,000 as the result of a voluntary act on plaintiff's part—e.g., sworn answers to interrogatories. Huffman v. Saul Holdings Ltd. Partnership (10th Cir. 1999) 194 F3d 1072, 1078.

19. This Notice of Removal is being filed within thirty (30) days after Defendant received Plaintiff's Statement of Damages from which it may first be ascertained that the case is removable. 28 U.S.C. § 1446(b).

Other Requirements for Removal Are Met

20. Removal of this lawsuit to the United States District Court for the Central District of California is proper as the Superior Court of the State of California, County of Los Angeles, where the action was originally filed, is located in this district.

21. Defendant is simultaneously filing a Notice of Removal to Federal

1 Court with the Superior Court of the State of California, County of Los Angeles, and
2 it has given notice and served this pleading on Plaintiff. (A true and correct copy of
3 the Notice to State Court of Removal to Federal Court filed with the Superior Court is
4 attached hereto as Exhibit C.)


5 **Demand for Jury Trial**

6 22. Separate and apart from removal requirements, counsel for Defendant
7 demands a jury trial.
8

9 Dated: November 9, 2022

THARPE & HOWELL, LLP

10
11 By: _____


JOHN K. FLOCK
Attorneys for Defendant,
COSTCO WHOLESALE
CORPORATION

THARPE & HOWELL, LLP
15250 Ventura Boulevard, Ninth Floor
Sherman Oaks, California 91403-3221

EXHIBIT A

Assigned for all purposes to: Spring Street Courthouse, Judicial Officer: Michael Whitaker

PLD-PI-001

ATTORNEY OR PARTY WITHOUT ATTORNEY (Name, State Bar number, and address): Brad Lee, Esq. [SBN: 221050]; Calvin Park, Esq. [SBN: 330109] BRAD LEE, a Professional Law Corporation 3600 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 2210 Los Angeles, CA 90010 TELEPHONE NO: (213) 384-2448 FAX NO. (Optional): (213) 384-7477 E-MAIL ADDRESS (Optional): bradleelaw@gmail.com ATTORNEY FOR (Name): Plaintiff, KYUNG HEE HUR	FOR COURT USE ONLY
SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF Los Angeles STREET ADDRESS: 111 N. Hill Street MAILING ADDRESS: 111 N. Hill Street CITY AND ZIP CODE: Los Angeles 90012 BRANCH NAME: Stanley Mosk	
PLAINTIFF: KYUNG HEE HUR, an individual DEFENDANT: COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION; and <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> DOES 1 TO 50 inclusive	
COMPLAINT—Personal Injury, Property Damage, Wrongful Death <input type="checkbox"/> AMENDED (Number): Type (check all that apply): <input type="checkbox"/> MOTOR VEHICLE <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> OTHER (specify): Negligence & Premises Lia. <input type="checkbox"/> Property Damage <input type="checkbox"/> Wrongful Death <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Personal Injury <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Other Damages (specify): Slip & Fall	
Jurisdiction (check all that apply): <input type="checkbox"/> ACTION IS A LIMITED CIVIL CASE Amount demanded <input type="checkbox"/> does not exceed \$10,000 <input type="checkbox"/> exceeds \$10,000, but does not exceed \$25,000 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ACTION IS AN UNLIMITED CIVIL CASE (exceeds \$25,000) <input type="checkbox"/> ACTION IS RECLASSIFIED by this amended complaint <input type="checkbox"/> from limited to unlimited <input type="checkbox"/> from unlimited to limited	CASE NUMBER: 22STCV32886

1. Plaintiff (name or names): KYUNG HEE HUR, an individual
 alleges causes of action against defendant (name or names):
 COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION, business entity form unknown; and DOES to 50, inclusive
2. This pleading, including attachments and exhibits, consists of the following number of pages: 6
3. Each plaintiff named above is a competent adult
 - a. ☐ except plaintiff (name):
 - (1) ☐ a corporation qualified to do business in California
 - (2) ☐ an unincorporated entity (describe):
 - (3) ☐ a public entity (describe):
 - (4) ☐ a minor ☐ an adult
 - (a) ☐ for whom a guardian or conservator of the estate or a guardian ad litem has been appointed
 - (b) ☐ other (specify):
 - (5) ☐ other (specify):
 - b. ☐ except plaintiff (name):
 - (1) ☐ a corporation qualified to do business in California
 - (2) ☐ an unincorporated entity (describe):
 - (3) ☐ a public entity (describe):
 - (4) ☐ a minor ☐ an adult
 - (a) ☐ for whom a guardian or conservator of the estate or a guardian ad litem has been appointed
 - (b) ☐ other (specify):
 - (5) ☐ other (specify):

☐ Information about additional plaintiffs who are not competent adults is shown in Attachment 3.

PLD-PI-001

SHORT TITLE: HUR v. COSTCO	CASE NUMBER:
-------------------------------	--------------

4. ☐ Plaintiff (name):
is doing business under the fictitious name (specify):

and has complied with the fictitious business name laws.
5. Each defendant named above is a natural person
- a. ☒ except defendant (name): see attachment 5a.
 (1) ☒ a business organization, form unknown
 (2) ☐ a corporation
 (3) ☐ an unincorporated entity (describe):

 (4) ☐ a public entity (describe):
 (5) ☐ other (specify):
- c. ☐ except defendant (name):
 (1) ☐ a business organization, form unknown
 (2) ☐ a corporation
 (3) ☐ an unincorporated entity (describe):

 (4) ☐ a public entity (describe):
 (5) ☐ other (specify):
- b. ☐ except defendant (name):
 (1) ☐ a business organization, form unknown
 (2) ☐ a corporation
 (3) ☐ an unincorporated entity (describe):

 (4) ☐ a public entity (describe):
 (5) ☐ other (specify):
- d. ☐ except defendant (name):
 (1) ☐ a business organization, form unknown
 (2) ☐ a corporation
 (3) ☐ an unincorporated entity (describe):

 (4) ☐ a public entity (describe):
 (5) ☐ other (specify):
- ☒ Information about additional defendants who are not natural persons is contained in Attachment 5.
6. The true names of defendants sued as Does are unknown to plaintiff.
 a. ☒ Doe defendants (specify Doe numbers): 1-25 were the agents or employees of other named defendants and acted within the scope of that agency or employment.
 b. ☒ Doe defendants (specify Doe numbers): 26-50 are persons whose capacities are unknown to plaintiff.
7. ☐ Defendants who are joined under Code of Civil Procedure section 382 are (names):
8. This court is the proper court because
 a. ☐ at least one defendant now resides in its jurisdictional area.
 b. ☐ the principal place of business of a defendant corporation or unincorporated association is in its jurisdictional area.
 c. ☒ injury to person or damage to personal property occurred in its jurisdictional area.
 d. ☐ other (specify):
9. ☐ Plaintiff is required to comply with a claims statute, and
 a. ☐ has complied with applicable claims statutes, or
 b. ☐ is excused from complying because (specify):

PLD-PI-001

SHORT TITLE: HUR v. COSTCO	CASE NUMBER:
--------------------------------------	--------------

10. The following causes of action are attached and the statements above apply to each (*each complaint must have one or more causes of action attached*):

- a. ☐ Motor Vehicle
- b. ☒ General Negligence
- c. ☐ Intentional Tort
- d. ☐ Products Liability
- e. ☒ Premises Liability
- f. ☐ Other (*specify*):

11. Plaintiff has suffered

- a. ☒ wage loss
- b. ☒ loss of use of property
- c. ☒ hospital and medical expenses
- d. ☒ general damage
- e. ☒ property damage
- f. ☒ loss of earning capacity
- g. ☒ other damage (*specify*):

Plaintiff requests any other relief that the court deems just and proper.

12. ☐ The damages claimed for wrongful death and the relationships of plaintiff to the deceased are

- a. ☐ listed in Attachment 12.
- b. ☐ as follows:

13. The relief sought in this complaint is within the jurisdiction of this court.

Stanley Mosk Courthouse at 111 N. Hill St., Los Angeles, CA 90012

14. Plaintiff prays for judgment for costs of suit; for such relief as is fair, just, and equitable; and for

- a. (1) ☒ compensatory damages
- (2) ☐ punitive damages

The amount of damages is (*in cases for personal injury or wrongful death, you must check (1)*):

- (1) ☒ according to proof
- (2) ☐ in the amount of: \$

15. ☐ The paragraphs of this complaint alleged on information and belief are as follows (*specify paragraph numbers*):

Date: October 6, 2022

Brad Lee, Esq.

(TYPE OR PRINT NAME)


(SIGNATURE OF PLAINTIFF OR ATTORNEY)

MC-025

SHORT TITLE: HUR v. COSTCO	CASE NUMBER:
-------------------------------	--------------

ATTACHMENT (Number): 5a

(This Attachment may be used with any Judicial Council form.)

Complaint is against Defendant(s):

COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION, business entity form unknown; and DOES 1 to 50, inclusive

(If the item that this Attachment concerns is made under penalty of perjury, all statements in this Attachment are made under penalty of perjury.)

Page _____ of _____

(Add pages as required)

PLD-PI-001(2)

SHORT TITLE: HUR v. COSTCO	CASE NUMBER:
-------------------------------	--------------

1 **CAUSE OF ACTION—General Negligence** Page 5
(number)

ATTACHMENT TO ☒ Complaint ☐ Cross - Complaint

(Use a separate cause of action form for each cause of action.)

GN-1. Plaintiff (name): KYUNG HEE HUR, an individual

alleges that defendant (name): COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION, business entity form

☒ Does 1 to 50

was the legal (proximate) cause of damages to plaintiff. By the following acts or omissions to act, defendant negligently caused the damage to plaintiff

on (date): November 1, 2020

at (place): Costco at 13463 Washington Blvd., Marina Del Rey, CA 90292.

(description of reasons for liability):

On November 1, 2020, at around 4:45 PM, Plaintiff was a paying customer shopping at Defendant COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION'S Marina Del Rey location at 13643 Washington Blvd. She slipped and fell on Avocado Oil which was spilled all over the floor of the aisle.

After, a manager Roberto called for an ambulance which immediately transported her to Southern California Hospital at Culver City LIVE - she sustained severe bodily injuries to her foot, ankle, back, neck, and head.

Plaintiff sustained above-mentioned bodily injuries due to the the incident caused by Defendant's negligence and lack of duty to keep their premises in a reasonably safe condition.

PLD-PI-001(4)

SHORT TITLE:
HUR v. COSTCO

CASE NUMBER:

2**CAUSE OF ACTION—Premises Liability**Page 6

(number)

ATTACHMENT TO ☒ Complaint ☐ Cross - Complaint

(Use a separate cause of action form for each cause of action.)

Prem.L-1. Plaintiff (name): KYUNG HEE HUR, an individual

alleges the acts of defendants were the legal (proximate) cause of damages to plaintiff.

On (date): November 1, 2020 plaintiff was injured on the following premises in the following

fashion (description of premises and circumstances of injury):

On November 1, 2020, at around 4:45 PM, Plaintiff was a paying customer shopping at Defendant COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION'S Marina Del Rey location at 13643 Washington Blvd. She slipped and fell on Avocado Oil which was spilled all over the floor of the aisle. After, she sustained severe bodily injuries to her foot, ankle, back, neck, and head. Plaintiff sustained above-mentioned bodily injuries due to the the incident caused by Defendant's negligence and lack of duty to keep their premises in a reasonably safe condition.

Prem.L-2. ☒ **Count One—Negligence** The defendants who negligently owned, maintained, managed and operated the described premises were (names):
COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION, business entity form unknown; and

☒ Does 1 to 50

Prem.L-3. ☒ **Count Two—Willful Failure to Warn** [Civil Code section 846] The defendant owners who willfully or maliciously failed to guard or warn against a dangerous condition, use, structure, or activity were (names):
COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION, business entity form unknown; and

☒ Does 1 to 50Plaintiff, a recreational user, was ☐ an invited guest ☒ a paying guest.

Prem.L-4. ☒ **Count Three—Dangerous Condition of Public Property** The defendants who owned public property on which a dangerous condition existed were (names):
COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION, business entity form unknown; and

☒ Does 1 to 50

- a. ☐ The defendant public entity had ☐ actual ☐ constructive notice of the existence of the dangerous condition in sufficient time prior to the injury to have corrected it.
- b. ☐ The condition was created by employees of the defendant public entity.

Prem.L-5. a. ☒ **Allegations about Other Defendants** The defendants who were the agents and employees of the other defendants and acted within the scope of the agency were (names):
COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION, business entity form unknown; and

☒ Does 1 to 50

- b. ☐ The defendants who are liable to plaintiffs for other reasons and the reasons for their liability are ☐ described in attachment Prem.L-5.b ☐ as follows (names):

Page 1 of 1

EXHIBIT B

- DO NOT FILE WITH THE COURT -
-UNLESS YOU ARE APPLYING FOR A DEFAULT JUDGMENT UNDER CODE OF CIVIL PROCEDURE § 585 -

ATTORNEY OR PARTY WITHOUT ATTORNEY (Name and Address): Brad Lee, Esq. [SBN: 221050] BRAD LEE, a Professional Law Corporation 3600 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 2210 Los Angeles, CA 90010 ATTORNEY FOR (name): Plaintiff, KYUNG HEE HUR	TELEPHONE NO.: (213) 384-2448	FOR COURT USE ONLY CASE NUMBER: 22STCV32886
SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF Los Angeles STREET ADDRESS: 111 North Hill Street MAILING ADDRESS: 111 North Hill Street CITY AND ZIP CODE: Los Angeles 90012 BRANCH NAME: Stanley Mosk		
PLAINTIFF: KYUNG HEE HUR DEFENDANT: COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION, et al.		
STATEMENT OF DAMAGES (Personal Injury or Wrongful Death)		

To (name of one defendant only): COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION
 Plaintiff (name of one plaintiff only): KYUNG HEE HUR, an individual
 seeks damages in the above-entitled action, as follows:

	AMOUNT
1. General damages	
a. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Pain, suffering, and inconvenience	\$ 100,000.00
b. <input type="checkbox"/> Emotional distress	\$
c. <input type="checkbox"/> Loss of consortium	\$
d. <input type="checkbox"/> Loss of society and companionship (wrongful death actions only)	\$
e. <input type="checkbox"/> Other (specify)	\$
f. <input type="checkbox"/> Other (specify)	\$
g. <input type="checkbox"/> Continued on Attachment 1.g.	
2. Special damages	
a. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Medical expenses (to date)	\$ 17,861.00
b. <input type="checkbox"/> Future medical expenses (present value)	\$
c. <input type="checkbox"/> Loss of earnings (to date)	\$
d. <input type="checkbox"/> Loss of future earning capacity (present value)	\$
e. <input type="checkbox"/> Property damage	\$
f. <input type="checkbox"/> Funeral expenses (wrongful death actions only)	\$
g. <input type="checkbox"/> Future contributions (present value) (wrongful death actions only)	\$
h. <input type="checkbox"/> Value of personal service, advice, or training (wrongful death actions only)	\$
i. <input type="checkbox"/> Other (specify)	\$
j. <input type="checkbox"/> Other (specify)	\$
k. <input type="checkbox"/> Continued on Attachment 2.k.	
3. <input type="checkbox"/> Punitive damages: Plaintiff reserves the right to seek punitive damages in the amount of (specify) .. \$	
when pursuing a judgment in the suit filed against you.	
Date: October 11, 2022	
Brad Lee, Esq.	

(TYPE OR PRINT NAME)

(SIGNATURE OF PLAINTIFF OR ATTORNEY FOR PLAINTIFF)

(Proof of service on reverse)

Page 1 of 2

EXHIBIT C

1 **THARPE & HOWELL, LLP**
2 **15250 Ventura Boulevard, Ninth Floor**
3 **Sherman Oaks, California 91403**
4 **(818) 205-9955; (818) 205-9944 fax**

5 JOHN K. FLOCK ESQ.; STATE BAR NO.: 200183
6 Email: jflock@tharpe-howell.com

7 Attorneys for Defendant,
8 COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION

9 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**
10 **COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES – STANLEY MOSK COURTHOUSE**

11 KYUNG HEE HUR, an individual,
12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION,
15 and DOES 1 to 50, Inclusive,
16 Defendants.

Case No. 22STV32886

NOTICE OF REMOVAL TO FEDERAL COURT

Complaint Filed: October 7, 2022

17
18 TO PLAINTIFF KYUNG HEE HUR AND THEIR ATTORNEYS OF RECORD:

19 PLEASE TAKE NOTICE THAT Defendant, Costco Wholesale Corporation
20 (“Defendant”) has filed a Notice of Removal of this action in the United States District Court for
21 the Central District of California, Western Division, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1332, 1334, 1441,
22 1446, and 1452, and as otherwise provided by law.

23 A true and correct copy of said Notice of Removal is attached to this notice and
24 incorporated herein by this reference as Exhibit “A”, and is served and filed herewith.

25 ///

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

1 Dated: November 9, 2022

THARPE & HOWELL, LLP

2
3 

4 By: _____
5 JOHN K. FLOCK
6 Attorneys for Defendant,
7 COSTCO WHOLESALE
8 CORPORATION
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

THARPE & HOWELL, LLP
15250 Ventura Boulevard, Ninth Floor
Sherman Oaks, California 91403-3221

PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

1. At the time of service I was at least 18 years of age and **not a party to this legal action.**
2. My business address is 15250 Ventura Boulevard, Ninth Floor, Sherman Oaks, CA 91403.
3. I served copies of the following documents (specify the exact title of each document served):

NOTICE OF REMOVAL TO FEDERAL COURT

4. I served the documents listed above in item 3 on the following persons at the addresses listed:

Brad Lee, Esq.
 Calvin Park,, Esq.
 Brad Lee, a Professional Law Corporation
 3600 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 2210
 Los Angeles, CA 90010
 (213) 384-2448 Phone
 (213) 384-7477 Fax
bradleelaw@gmail.com
calvin.bllaw@gmail.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff,
 KYUNG HEE HUR

5. a. **By personal service.** I personally delivered the documents on the date shown below to the persons at the addresses listed above in item 4. (1) For a party represented by an attorney, delivery was made to the attorney or at the attorney's office by leaving the documents in an envelope or package clearly labeled to identify the attorney being served with a receptionist or an individual in charge of the office. (2) For a party delivery was made to the party or by leaving the documents at the party's residence between the hours of eight in the morning and six in the evening with some person not less than 18 years of age.
- b. **By United States mail.** I enclosed the documents in a sealed envelope or package addressed to the persons at the addresses in item 4 and (*specify one*):
 - (1) deposited the sealed envelope with the United States Postal Service, with the postage fully prepaid on the date shown below, or
 - (2) placed the envelope for collection and mailing on the date shown below, following our ordinary business practices. I am readily familiar with this business's practice for collecting and processing correspondence for mailing. On the same day that correspondence is placed for collection and mailing, it is deposited in the ordinary course of business with the United States Postal Service, in a sealed envelope with postage fully prepaid.

I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Sherman Oaks, California.

- c. **By overnight delivery.** I enclosed the documents on the date shown below in an envelope or package provided by an overnight delivery carrier and addressed to the person at the addresses in item 4. I placed the envelope or package for collection and overnight delivery at an office or a regularly utilized drop box of the overnight delivery carrier.
- d. **By fax transmission.** Based on an agreement of the parties to accept service by fax transmission, I faxed the documents on the date shown below to the fax numbers of the persons listed in item 4. No error was reported by the fax machine that I used. A copy of the fax transmission, which I printed out, is attached to my file copy.
- e. X **By e-mail or electronic transmission.** By e-mailing the document(s) to the person(s) at the e-mail address(es) listed in item 4 pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1010.6. I caused the documents to be sent on the date shown below to the e-mail addresses of the persons listed in item 4. No electronic message or other indication that the transmission was unsuccessful was received within a reasonable time after the transmission.

6. I served the documents by the means described in item 5 on *(date): See Below*

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

11/9/2022
DATE

Candice VanDeudekom
(TYPE OR PRINT NAME)


(SIGNATURE OF DECLARANT)

I:\33000-000\33227\Pleadings\Nt of Removal to Federal Court.docx

THARPE & HOWELL, LLP
15250 Ventura Boulevard, Ninth Floor
Sherman Oaks, California 91403-3221

THARPE & HOWELL, LLP
15250 Ventura Boulevard, Ninth Floor
Sherman Oaks, California 91403-3221

PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

1. At the time of service I was at least 18 years of age and **not a party to this legal action.**
2. My business address is 15250 Ventura Boulevard, Ninth Floor, Sherman Oaks, CA 91403.
3. I served copies of the following documents (specify the exact title of each document served):

NOTICE OF REMOVAL OF ACTION UNDER 28 U.S.C. § 1441(b) (DIVERSITY)

4. I served the documents listed above in item 3 on the following persons at the addresses listed:

Brad Lee, Esq.
Calvin Park,, Esq.
Brad Lee, a Professional Law
Corporation
3600 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 2210
Los Angeles, CA 90010
(213) 384-2448 Phone
(213) 384-7477 Fax
bradleelaw@gmail.com
calvin.bllaw@gmail.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff,
KYUNG HEE HUR

5. a. **By personal service.** I personally delivered the documents on the date shown below to the persons at the addresses listed above in item 4. (1) For a party represented by an attorney, delivery was made to the attorney or at the attorney's office by leaving the documents in an envelope or package clearly labeled to identify the attorney being served with a receptionist or an individual in charge of the office. (2) For a party delivery was made to the party or by leaving the documents at the party's residence between the hours of eight in the morning and six in the evening with some person not less than 18 years of age.
- b. **By United States mail.** I enclosed the documents in a sealed envelope or package addressed to the persons at the addresses in item 4 and *(specify one)*:
 - (1) deposited the sealed envelope with the United States Postal Service, with the postage fully prepaid on the date shown below, or

THARPE & HOWELL, LLP
15250 Ventura Boulevard, Ninth Floor
Sherman Oaks, California 91403-3221

(2) — placed the envelope for collection and mailing on the date shown below, following our ordinary business practices. I am readily familiar with this business's practice for collecting and processing correspondence for mailing. On the same day that correspondence is placed for collection and mailing, it is deposited in the ordinary course of business with the United States Postal Service, in a sealed envelope with postage fully prepaid.

I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Sherman Oaks, California.

c. — **By overnight delivery.** I enclosed the documents on the date shown below in an envelope or package provided by an overnight delivery carrier and addressed to the person at the addresses in item 4. I placed the envelope or package for collection and overnight delivery at an office or a regularly utilized drop box of the overnight delivery carrier.

d. — **By fax transmission.** Based on an agreement of the parties to accept service by fax transmission, I faxed the documents on the date shown below to the fax numbers of the persons listed in item 4. No error was reported by the fax machine that I used. A copy of the fax transmission, which I printed out, is attached to my file copy.

e. X **By e-mail or electronic transmission.** By e-mailing the document(s) to the person(s) at the e-mail address(es) listed in item 4 pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1010.6. I caused the documents to be sent on the date shown below to the e-mail addresses of the persons listed in item 4. No electronic message or other indication that the transmission was unsuccessful was received within a reasonable time after the transmission.

6. I served the documents by the means described in item 5 on (date): *See Below*

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

11/9/2022
DATE

Candice VanDeudekom
(TYPE OR PRINT NAME)


(SIGNATURE OF DECLARANT)

I:\33000-000\33227\Pleadings\FEDERAL\Ntc of Removal - Diversity.docx